

AGENDA

1st Meeting, 2020 (Session 5)

Friday 28 February 2020

The Committee will meet at 10:30 am in The Mary Fairfax Somerville Room (CR2).

1. **Decision on taking business in private:** The Committee will decide whether to take items 3 and 4 in private.

2. **Transition from education to employment for young women from ethnic minorities:** The Committee will hear evidence from—

Surbjit Dhillon, Confidence and Wellbeing Officer, Council of Ethnic Minority Voluntary Sector Organisations (CEMVO);

Fergus McMillan, Senior Equalities and Diversity Advocate, Skills Development Scotland;

Trishna Singh, Director, Sikh Sanjog;

Viana Maya, pRESPECT Project Lead, Adopt an Intern, and:

Dilraj Sokhi-Watson, Interim Co-CEO Amina the Muslim Women's Resource Centre

3. **Transition from education to employment for young women from ethnic minorities:** The Committee will consider evidence heard earlier in the meeting.

4. **Work programme:** The Committee will review its approach for all future meetings on the inquiry.

The papers for this meeting are as follows—

Agenda item 2

SPICe Briefing Paper
Witness Submissions

SPICe Briefing

28 February 2020

Transition from education to employment for young women from ethnic minorities

This morning members will be hearing from a range of witnesses, allowing for a discussion and exploration of issues pertinent to the **inquiry remit**:

To investigate what measures are being taken to increase employment opportunities for women from ethnic minorities, including recruitment, retention and development of policies and best practice.

This paper aims to assist members of the committee in identifying the main issues with witnesses and some lines of questioning they might like to follow. What they hear will inform their ongoing engagement work.

It was supposed at the outset of this piece of work that there are likely to be 'gaps' in policy and practice in relation to ethnic minority young women getting into sustained employment. These 'gaps' could be manifested in:

- what is happening in schools;
- society generally, through assumptions and lack of understanding;
- skills development organisations, and in
- the formulation of work practices and policies.

These 'gaps' can unintentionally create or ignore barriers to employment for young ethnic minority women.

The **purpose of the inquiry** is to find out what can be done to increase:

- opportunities and employer accountability in relation to employment, training, retention, promotion and development of women from ethnic minorities,
- what can be done to share best practice between organisations and
- what can be done to strengthen links between education services, employability support and employers.

The **witnesses** for this evidence session have been selected to be able to represent the following areas:

- Education & third sector/community providers of advice and employability programmes designed to support young women from ethnic minorities into employment
- Employers and staff responsible for developing and implementing policies to recruit, retain and develop young women from ethnic minorities

Some background on the witness organisations

CEMVO

According to [CEMVO's website](#) it aims to increase the profile and involvement of the ethnic minority voluntary sector, and thereby ethnic minority communities:

“CEMVO Scotland’s mission is to level the playing field for Scotland’s ethnic minority voluntary sector and its communities. We will do this by:

- building capacity and mobilising skills in organisations and their people;
- fostering both individual and collective leadership;
- enabling active participation in community, democratic and civic life; and
- working strategically to raise the profile of and create opportunities for the sector.

All of our work will contribute to a Scottish society where ethnic minority communities’ contribution is recognised for its part in making Scotland a successful country.”

Skills Development Scotland (SDS) (provided submission)

[SDS](#) is a national skills body that seeks to support the people and businesses of Scotland to develop and apply their skills. They aim to increase productivity in Scotland by ensuring that businesses are able to access people who have the right skills, by developing those skills in collaboration with employers

Their three-year plan sets out to ensure that:

- All people in Scotland have the skills, information and opportunities to succeed in the labour market.
- Scotland’s businesses drive productivity and inclusive growth.
- Scotland has a dynamic and responsive skills system.

SDS produced a Careers Information Advice and Guidance ([CIAG Equality Action Plan](#)) in December 2019, that they refer to in their submission. The plan runs for about a year, and covers a broad range of minority groups, whose experience will vary widely. However, SDS highlights the actions relating to gender and race in its submission. These actions are mainly linked to signposting, networking, and a review of their own messaging.

Sikh Sanjog (provided submission)

[Sikh Sanjog](#) is an Edinburgh-based organisation that supports and links Sikh women in Edinburgh to opportunities through a range of services. They will support women into education and careers. They also provide services for organisations and stakeholders, educating and informing them through different workshops, consultancy and resources about Sikh culture in Scotland, offering perspective and insight that only they can.

Adopt an Intern

[Adopt an Intern](#) claim to be 'inclusive employment specialists'. They work with private, public and third sector employers, providing access to graduates and 'returners'. They are not-for-profit and have a specific project based on 'diversity' called '[Diversity works](#)'. pRESPECT is a specific programme within their diversity work 'to empower BME people to move into meaningful jobs by providing intensive personal career development courses including group workshops, one to one coaching, proactive employment preparations, employer engagement, and networking events'.

Amina – Muslim Women’s Resource Centre

[Amina](#) is a Scottish-based organisation (see submission), supporting and empowering Muslim women and seeking to address issues Muslim women face in Scotland. Their submission summarises some of the challenges facing Muslim women in Scotland, not only the workforce:

“there is a low-level of awareness regarding the intersectional nature of BME women’s needs in employment and the wide society¹. Additionally, BME women’s labour market participation in Scotland is significantly lower, where likely to experience a 'triple penalty' based on their gender, ethnicity and faith when accessing the paid labour market”

Their submission goes on to state a set of clear recommendations for improving the situation and awareness of issues facing Muslim women. Some of these recommendations are likely to apply to other BME groups.

Further background:

Data and statistics

The Scottish Government and its Agencies collect, analyse and publish equality evidence across a wide range of policy areas. Their '[Equality Evidence Finder](#)' allows the user to look at how different equality characteristics intersect with policy areas.

¹ Kamenu N. et al (2012) Ethnic Minority Women in the Scottish Labour Market: Employers' Perceptions
Ethnic Minority Women in the Scottish Labour Market: Employers' Perceptions

The UK Government publish statistics '[Ethnicity Facts and Figures](#)'. Some of the information is taken from the census, some from the annual population surveys as well as from other national data sources, such as the Higher Education Statistics Agency.

There are sections on [employment](#) and [education and skills training](#), across England, Wales and Scotland, as well as data on [workforce diversity in the public sector, business and self-employment](#).

There is a wealth of data both recent and trend data, and members of the committee might wish to identify some specific and comparative data to explore with the witnesses.

Developing the Young Workforce (DYW):

The original [Developing the Young Workforce report](#), Scotland's youth employment strategy, included a number of recommendations related to engaging and supporting more young women/girls, especially those from BME groups:

Recommendation 27: Promotion and communication of career options should actively target equalities groups to promote diverse participation across gender, Black & Minority Ethnic groups, young people with disabilities and care leavers. The promotion of Modern Apprenticeship opportunities should be to the fore of this activity”.

Recommendation 31: A targeted campaign to promote the full range of Modern Apprenticeships to young people and parents from the BME community should be developed and launched to present the benefits of work-based learning as a respected career option and alternative to university.

Recommendation 32: SDS should set a realistic but stretching improvement target to increase the number of young people from BME groups starting Modern Apprenticeships. Progress against this should be reported on annually.

The [2018/19 DYW report](#): states that:

“The ethnic intersectional initiative pilot programme launched last year by SDS as well as the pre-apprenticeship support for people from Minority Ethnic backgrounds in their application to apprenticeship opportunities has been extended for a further year. Following the extended pilot, SDS will expand and embed best practice learning from this work and report on this activity in the months ahead.”

[Fair Start Scotland](#) is the new (devolved) employment support service which helps people living in Scotland to find work. This is really for people who have been out of the labour market for a while and the applicants usually face considerable barriers to gaining employment. There is a regional dimension to this as providers win contracts from the Scottish Government to deliver services in each region. Providers can be private companies, third sector organisations or local authorities. The prime

providers can then sub-contract to other organisations to focus on a particular group of people.

Map of tier 1 providers: <http://www.employabilityinscotland.com/fair-start-scotland/map-of-provider-contacts/>

Race Equality Action Plan

The Scottish Government has a [Race Equality Action Plan, \(REAP\)](#) which runs till 2021. In its [one-year update report](#) it states that:

“In total in 2017/18 and 2018/19 we provided over £2.6 million in funding each year to support programmes and organisations promoting race equality”

It also describes work done in two areas: employment and education and life-long learning:

“Employment

Workplace Equality Fund

The aim of the fund is to support private businesses in reducing employment inequalities, discrimination and barriers in the workplace. This was across multiple sectors including arts, culture, tourism, construction, agriculture, transport and STEM.

In addressing long standing barriers faced by women, older workers, ethnic minority and disabled people, over 25% of the funds successful projects are aimed at supporting the ME community (6 out of 22 successful projects).

Education & Lifelong Learning

Early learning workforce

With the expansion of early learning and childcare provision, colleagues in Education are working with several organisations to increase minority ethnic teachers into the profession. The Teaching in a diverse Scotland: increasing and retaining minority ethnic teachers report was published in November 2018. Work to implement recommendations in the report is ongoing.

School resources

Anti-bullying guidance has also been developed in conjunction with respectme and CRER. The resource ‘Addressing Inclusion – Effectively Challenging Racism in Schools’ was published in February 2019.”

The Equality and Human Rights Committee within the Scottish Parliament have [reviewed the Race Equality Action Plan](#) and as a consequence have launched a more detailed inquiry on issues relating to race equality, employment and skills in Scotland. Views can be submitted until April 17 2020.

Previous work done in the Scottish Parliament

Previous work carried out by Scottish Parliament committees has already highlighted the following key themes relevant to this inquiry:

- Outcomes for minority ethnic communities have not improved over the past two decades.
- The issues affecting minority ethnic communities are already known, the focus should now be on action.
- A lack of institutional memory impacts on the progress being made.
- Public bodies must learn from existing best practice and not waste resources reinventing policies.
- Governance structures should ensure accountability for progress at all levels within an organisation.

There is a [SPICe briefing on Ethnicity and Employment](#), published in 2015, written to assist the Equal Opportunities Committee in its deliberations as part of its inquiry: [Removing Barriers: race, ethnicity and employment](#). The briefing and Committee Report will provide further background and an opportunity to consider any progress over the past five years in Scotland.

Some potential themes and questions to explore with witnesses

1. Members might wish to ask the panel to briefly outline what they think are the main issues facing young women from ethnic minority backgrounds moving into employment.
2. How are women from ethnic minority backgrounds supported into employment by:
 - a. school careers advice service
 - b. SDS
 - c. third sector organisations
 - d. Government policy
3. What is not working between school, college or arrival in Scotland and employment? Why do you think this is?
4. What positive changes to practice, policy and awareness have become evident in Scotland over the past five years? Are there any good international comparisons or examples from elsewhere in the UK?
5. What examples of best practice are there in Scotland to encourage recruitment, retention and development of minority ethnic women such as mentoring schemes, leadership programmes, etc?
6. What is happening to address racism and discrimination in schools and careers information and guidance programmes, and how do you know if it is working?

7. What is happening to address racism and discrimination in the workplace, such as diversity networks, cultural awareness, flexible working, harassment policies, etc?
8. What actions should your organisations prioritise to improve outcomes for ethnic minority women entering the workplace?
9. How well has the Scottish Government responded, through the Race Equality Action Plan, for example, to the findings of the Equal Opportunities Committee Inquiry into removing barriers to employment for ethnic minorities, undertaken in 2015/16? Why has change been so slow in this area
10. What further actions should the government prioritise to overcome the barriers that BME women face in training and accessing employment?
11. Where should investment be best directed in improving the experience of young ethnic minority women entering work?
12. Is it possible to perceive any impacts of Brexit in terms of attitudes, policy and practice?

Anne Jepson
SPICe Research
Date 25 February 2020

Note: Committee briefing papers are provided by SPICe for the use of Scottish Parliament committees and clerking staff. They provide focused information or respond to specific questions or areas of interest to committees and are not intended to offer comprehensive coverage of a subject area.

The Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh, EH99 1SP www.parliament.scot

YOUNG WOMEN LEAD 2019/20 COMMITTEE MEETING 1

WRITTEN SUBMISSIONS

Ahead of the meeting on Friday 28 February, three written submissions were received from organisations invited to take part as witnesses. Full copies of these submissions are included below.

1. Amina – the Muslim Women’s Resources Centre
2. Skills Development Scotland
3. Sikh Sanjog

1. Amina – the Muslim Women’s Resource Centre

AMINA MWRC welcomes the opportunity to contribute to the session on ‘the transition for young women from ethnic minorities from education to employment’. Our brief written response is noted below-

Current status in Scotland-

Employers perception on Black Minority Ethnic women’s labour market participation indicates there is a low-level of awareness regarding the intersectional nature of BME women’s needs in employment and the wide society¹. Additionally, BME women’s labour market participation in Scotland is significantly lower, where likely to experience a ‘triple penalty’ based on their gender, ethnicity and faith when accessing the paid labour market. While there is an increased agreement on employing an intersectional approach to policymaking including employability, there is an absence of Scotland specific evidence on BME women’s experience of the labour market.

To advance BME women’s labour market equality intersectional approach, following are recommended-

- Proactive recruitment strategies and career support through all stages of the employability pipeline.
- Recognise there is lack of evidence on occupational segregation and pay gaps experienced by BME women in Scotland. This leads to the wider question whether the sole aim of increasing women’s labour market participation or BME women can access progressive routes to employment.
- Recognition of and addressing barriers to BME women in the recruitment *and* progression within STEM strands.
- Recognising the gender dimension of economic inactivity within the BME community is also segmented along ethnicity, where a significant proportion of inactive women are from the Bangladeshi/Pakistani background².

¹ Kamenu N. et al (2012) Ethnic Minority Women in the Scottish Labour Market: Employers' Perceptions Ethnic Minority Women in the Scottish Labour Market: Employers' Perceptions

² Close the Gap (2019) Research on Black and minority ethnic women’s experiences of employment in Scotland

2. Skills Development Scotland

Career Information Advice and Guidance (CIAG)

National Careers service

Skills Development Scotland (SDS) seeks to equip each individual with highly effective Career Management Skills which will empower them to proactively direct their career, as well as give them the ability to manage key transition points throughout their lives. SDS has a network of Careers Advisers working in every maintained school in Scotland, as well as at SDS Careers Centres across the country. SDS enhanced CIAG services in 2015 in line with recommendations from Developing the Young Workforce (DYW) and the implementation of the Career Education Standard 3-18 (CES).

The SDS service offer for young people in schools now includes:

- At P7/S1 transition, every young person is entitled to a face to face engagement with SDS Careers staff to support their transition
- At S2/S3, every young person, including those making their subject choices, is entitled to a face to face engagement with SDS Careers staff to support this key decision-making phase. This is in a group setting and then followed up with the entitlement to an individual 1:1 guidance interview. Parents/carers can be part of this 1:1 or have this at another time
- In S3, the school needs-based approach identifies those young people who require targeted enhanced support and these individuals can receive a 1:1 guidance sessions and case management support
- Continuation of the S4 - S6 targeted support for young people who have been identified as requiring it
- All young people are entitled to a face to face engagement with the Careers Adviser in a group session throughout the senior phase during their preparations for leaving school
- Any pupil at any time can request additional support
- Parental engagement from P7/S1 to S6

[My World of Work](#), our online CIAG platform, has been developed through engagement with customers and partners to underpin the development of pupil capacities and make available a range of tools to support individuals. This includes the subject choice tool to explore opportunities and pathways relating to careers, jobs and industries; supporting young people to make informed decisions during the critical transition period. The Skills Pathways tool is an interactive way of exploring labour market opportunities and the wide range of routes and pathways that can be taken to progress towards these. To assess the effectiveness of delivery, SDS undertakes a regular Senior Phase Survey and centre-based surveys to continually receive feedback and improve services to meet their needs.

Since April 2014, external reviews of Scotland's CIAG services by local authority area have been conducted by Education Scotland. External review teams, including HM Inspectors and associate assessors, undertake

independent reviews of the quality of provision of CIAG delivered by SDS on behalf of the Scottish Government, under a service level agreement between the Scottish Government and Education Scotland. The results of these reviews have been overwhelmingly positive, and can be found on the [Education Scotland website](#).

Our all-age careers service continues post-school through the network of Careers Centres and in local partnership and outreach premises.

Our post school services include:

- Support to develop an individual's career management skills
- One-to-one career guidance
- Employability support
- Information and links to local employers
- Labour market information
- Access to all learning and skills pathways, including apprenticeship opportunities
- Career events
- Online career information and advice
- Information about funding
- Support for parents and carers
- Work with other partners

Next Steps

Our Next Steps service offer proactively engages and coordinates support for individuals within the Opportunities For All cohort. For care experienced young people this offer is available up to their 26th birthday.

Next Steps aims to develop and deliver a progressive and cohesive CIAG service offer which:

- Enables customers to develop their CMS, recognising improvement at each stage as they progress towards a sustainable destination.
- Extends our coaching relationship developed with pupils in schools.
- Enables customers to receive ongoing support even after they have progressed into a positive outcome.

The extent and nature of this support is always discussed and agreed with the customer.

Young people accessing our Next Steps service are entitled to targeted one-to-one support from our post-school teams based in our careers centres and outreach delivery locations across the country. This ongoing commitment continues their skills development towards sustainable participation. The service offer is tailored to meet the needs and learning style of each individual and combines a range of engagements including needs assessments, individual coaching guidance and group sessions.

Universal Service

While our support is targeted at those who need it most, we offer a universal, all-age CIAG service for everyone in Scotland. This includes those in employment who are seeking to change or progress in their career. All of our

face-to-face services are available to any individual and the type and level of support is agreed in line with their needs.

CIAG Equality Action Plan

We published our [CIAG Equality Action Plan](#) in December 2019. This plan sets out our commitment to an inclusive CIAG service and the actions we will take to ensure this.

SDS's ambition is that all customers, including those from defined equality groups, experience an inclusive CIAG service and get the right support from us to meet their individual needs. We want them to be able to develop and use Career Management Skills throughout their lives to make well informed career decisions that are based on their interests, strengths and ambitions and that aren't influenced by stereotypes or anticipated barriers.

The plan will run to March 2021 and outlines continuing challenges for identified equality groups and the specific actions SDS has committed to taking to address them. The identified groups are:

- additional support needs and disability
- age (older workers, 50+ years)
- care experience
- ethnic minority
- gender
- poverty
- pregnancy and maternity
- religion and belief
- sexual orientation
- transgender

Development of the plan

The plan was developed through consultation with external partners and internally with support from a range of teams, including: Regional CIAG, including equality representatives and champions and the HR Equality and Diversity, NTP Equality and Communications and Marketing teams. A consultation on the actions was also carried out with a range of equality partners and some customers.

The actions discussed during the consultation period, were initially based on a review of available evidence. This included our performance information, and research carried out by our Evaluation & Research team, including the [Equality Evidence Review](#), equality breakdowns of our [Senior Phase Survey](#) findings and customer feedback and the [Young people in Scotland - Gender Perspectives](#) report. Evidence from research with specific equality groups was also considered, including the [BME Pupils in Schools](#), [CIAG Services and Post-school Transitions for Care Experienced Young People](#) and [Improving Gender Balance](#) reports.

Gender

As noted, actions were developed through a review of available evidence and in consultation with partners, including Close the Gap. We also contributed to the Scottish Government's Gender Pay Gap Action Plan and aligned our actions with the discussions of this group. The plan acknowledges that while some progress has been made, there remain gender differences in both

subject and course choice in school, further and higher education and within the labour market, including apprenticeships.

Currently through our engagements with young people and their parents/carers, our CIAG colleagues challenge stereotypes and the concept of “male/female” jobs. The actions relating to gender in our CIAG Equality Action Plan will build upon this. Specifically, we will:

- ensure that our colleagues have the information and resources they need to understand gender inequality
- continue to capitalise on our engagements with young people and their parents/carers to challenge gender stereotypes
- review our messaging to ensure that we are addressing the range of issues that discourage young people from pursuing non-traditional careers
- promote work-based learning pathways to young women and their key influencers to address the inequalities in labour market outcomes

Ethnic Minority Communities

Actions in the CIAG Equality Action Plan are also focused on promoting our services to ethnic minority communities and signposting to the information they need to understand their rights and enter and sustain education, employment or training. Specifically, we will:

- Develop local and national partnerships with those who support ethnic minority communities (including refugees/asylum seekers and Gypsy/Travellers) to promote our CIAG services and web services
- Share information from Glasgow Caledonian University's Skills Recognition Unit to support those who have migrated to Scotland to gain recognition and validation for the skills/qualifications they have gained outwith the UK, and to access opportunities
- Signpost migrants, refugees and asylum seekers to information on their rights in education, training and employment

Apprenticeships Equality Action Plan

SDS is also responsible for the administration of Scotland's Apprenticeships on behalf of the Scottish Government. The [SDS Apprenticeships Equality Action Plan](#) sets out our commitment to ensuring that individuals from a diverse range of backgrounds can access work-based learning opportunities and achieve equitable outcomes. Although we do not recruit apprentices directly, we can use our commissioning and contract management process to influence the actions of our contracted training providers, including encouraging them to promote good practice to employers. As part of the contract monitoring process, Modern Apprenticeship (MA) training providers are required to complete a Quality Action Plan, which includes equality actions to show steps taken to address underrepresentation. Further initiatives implemented in conjunction with the Apprenticeships Equality Action Plan include:

- SDS has published a [guide](#) to help training providers attract applicants from BME communities and identify the support available to enable

entry and progression on National Training Programmes. It includes tips to attract BME candidates, answers to FAQs, BME eligibility for the MA programme and other support, as well as a list of BME Support Organisations by location.

- Skills Development Scotland are piloting the Ethnic Intersectionality Incentive (EII), a recruitment incentive to support entry to the MA programme for individuals from BME communities who have further barriers to entry to the MA programme. This is one of the measures aimed at tackling under representation from those with protected characteristics and acknowledges the disadvantage of those with more than one protected characteristic. This pilot recognises that in Scotland black women, ethnic minority women and disabled women are among the most disadvantaged in the labour market, with Muslim women experiencing particular disadvantage. Similar cumulative disadvantage is often experienced by LGBT+ members of ethnic minorities.
- The Scottish Apprenticeship Advisory Board (SAAB) provides employer and industry leadership and contribution to the development of apprenticeships in Scotland. SAAB's Employer Equality Group has established a Gender Commission in recognition of the need to address occupational gender segregation, the first of its kind to do so specifically through the lens of apprenticeships and work-based learning in Scotland. The Commission aims to develop recommendations and proposals that offer business-ready, practical solutions on what employers can do now, and in the future, to address any real or perceived barriers to improving gender diversity in their workforce.

3. Sikh Sanjog

We have created internal routes into employment for roles that women from the Sikh community would not normally apply for through Sikh Sanjog i.e Youth workers, Community Development Workers and through our Social Enterprise

Supported women to access higher education within the hospitality sector with 6 women in one year doing their SQA in hospitality we work in close partnership with Skills Development Scotland and other mainstream providers to create these opportunities. The mainstream approach of people going to the jobcentre etc does not work for many ethnic women even although the language barrier is not the problem but the internal stigma of the job centre being unemployed is still very much alive. Through our links with Community Jobs Fund we have supported over 20 young Sikh women to gain SVQ LEVEL 3 in admin. There is a lot of handholding and support required on a one to one basis and this is often overlooked by mainstream.