

Clackmannanshire Council

Scottish Parliament Education & Skills Committee Inquiry

June 2017

**Part 1 Inspection and Remedial work of the current estate since
January 2016**

All schools were fully inspected

PPP Academies opened in 2009

We worked with our PFI partners Clackmannanshire Schools Education Partnership (CSEP) regarding the three Academies opened in 2009.

In May 2016 CSEP engaged with Curtins Consultancy Structural Engineers to have the schools inspected in light of the Edinburgh schools issues arising in April 2016. The advice provided by Scottish Government as a result of the Edinburgh Inquiry was provided later in 2016. All recommendations from the Inquiry have been overtaken.

It is worth noting that Clackmannanshire Council employed a full time team incorporating a Project Manager , a Project Coordinator and a Clerk of Works on the PFI Project started in 2007, this enabled the Council to monitor and measure the quality assurance during the construction period.

Hub projects

Redwell Primary School opened 2014

Hub East Central Scotland Ltd has appointed Scott Bennett Associates to carry out a review of the external masonry wall ties and restraints at Redwell Primary School, Alloa. The review comprises a Desktop Study of the project drawings and specifications, an assessment of the capacity of specified ties and restraints against the calculated wind loadings, and a visual inspection of the external envelope from the ground level to identify any apparent significant structural defects in the masonry cladding. The visual inspection was carried out on 14 March 2017 and no significant structural defects were noted during the visual survey. The review of the design The Scott Bennet Associates review of the external wall tie and head restraint design for Redwell Primary School has been concluded with no issues with regard to the design of the wall ties or any significant structural defects noted during the visual inspection. Report conclusions are as follows:

E.Turnbull Scottish Government Response 160517

"No significant structural defects were noted during our visual survey. Following our assessment of the design capacity of the specified wall ties against the design loading:

- Cavity masonry wall ties: These were found to have a capacity in excess of the applied design loading.
- Masonry cladding to timber frame: These were found to meet with the criteria set out in BS 5268-6.1:1996 Table B.1."

A full copy of the report is available, however due to the file size it would need to be sent separately if required.

All other Educational establishments

A condition survey of all school buildings was undertaken in 2014 and a programme of works, based on the requirements identified in the surveys, planned for 2016-2020 after due consideration of the planning needs of the education estate. No structural faults were identified at this time.

All of Clackmannanshire schools were visually inspected in April 2016 and a working spreadsheet kept of any issues noted from a visual inspection. Any areas of concern were then checked by CRA, Civil & Structural Engineers. There were no issues in the buildings however two boundary walls were found to require repair. One wall at Fishcross Primary School and one at Tillicoultry Primary School, both repairs are due for completion in June 2017.

PPP Reports – faults identified

The reports that were prepared in May 2016 are the property of Curtins and are available if required. As stated on Page 1 Section 1.3 on each of the separate reports these cannot be used by any Third Party without the authority of Curtins.

Drawings were examined taking particular note of the specification of the wall ties, size of cavities, head restraint details and wind post designs. Site inspections were completed by a suitably qualified Engineer at each of the three sites. There is no indication from these surveys of any of the structural defects identified in the Edinburgh Inquiry.

Remedial Work Undertaken

There were two **minor** affected areas noted in the surveys undertaken at the PPP schools :-

- 1) Minor Bulge in external wall at Alloa, West Gable end.

An extension piece was added to an existing Lintel, Bricks were removed. Some minor cracking in this location was also evident and was repaired with helix reinforcement across the crack in each bed joint. All works completed on 10th December 2016.

2) PE Block Lornshill track reinforcement showing to finished facing brick wall

Track reinforcement end pincher found to have a kink in it, reinforcement was adjusted and bricks have been repointed. Works completed 25th November 2016.

Scheduled work in the three PPP Academies..

There is no structural work scheduled for any of the schools related to wall ties or issues related to the Edinburgh issues.

There is a Planned Preventative Maintenance Schedule agreed each year for each of the three schools, this spreadsheet is quite large and can be made available if required.

There is work planned for the summer holiday on Alloa Academy Roof across the PE and Courtyard area. This Contractor's notice of Change is to rectify a defect with the rainwater drainage located in these areas.

Regular checks on Fire doors are completed to Amey, the facilities management provider, Amey 99-29 standard (last check January 2017), fire dampers are completed to SFG20-16-03 (last check Feb 2017) and fire stopping is completed to Amey 99-50 (last check January 2017) . All are completed at 6 monthly intervals.

There are no further works planned in light of the Report of the Independent Inquiry into the Construction of Edinburgh Schools

Part 2 . Quality Assurance on Capital projects

The quality assurance procedures are integrated into the capital works procedures manual. In large projects or programmes, individuals take on the role of assuring the quality of specific products/outputs of the project on behalf of the Programme Manager or Projects Director. A summary of the QA procedures are outlined below.

Details of quality standards of the project's final outputs/products are defined in the definition stage of the project and included in the project mandates.

In the planning stage and In consultation with the Project Clerk of Works (CoW), the Project Coordinator(PC) prepares a written description (Quality Management Plan) of how agreed quality standards will be monitored and finally checked and "signed-off" – including details of any legislative, policy or national standards to be met.

During the managing product delivery stage, officers have to strike a balance between quality and cost to ensure value for money outcomes. This will include managing risks/ issues and implementing mitigation strategies in place should risk occur or issues arise.

The PC and CoW are responsible for supervising works on site. The PC co-ordinates the work of the CoW by means of weekly meetings to confirm CoW instructions to contractor. The PC liaises with contract Quantity Surveyor to estimate value of CoW directions and reconciles values with the final account.

Once the Practical Completion has been issued the PC will liaise with the Council's Quality Control Officer to ensure all completion dates, certificates and improvement information has been recorded in the appropriate database.

The project closure procedures include evaluation of adherence to the project time scales, contractor conduct, standard of customer services, regulation compliance, defects management and quality of completed works.

Detailed roles and responsibilities are outlined in the capital works project management procedures manual.

The procedures outlined above are based on a time when resources were available, they will need to be reviewed in the future to reflect the current staff establishment, reduction in staffing and restructuring that the Council is currently undergoing. The previous method of monitoring and managing contractors relied on the availability of suitably qualified and experienced staff. Past experience of vigilant monitoring, of PPP contractors predominately by means of a CoW and PC has ensured that all subsequent capital projects were similarly monitored.

The quality assurance methods outlined above have not been reassessed since 2016, however the Council has undertaken a significant change to the structure of delivery recently, January 2017. Staffing reductions and an increased externalisation of work is likely to impact on the internal quality assurance methodologies previously used.

Prepared on behalf of Clackmannanshire Council

Chief Executive Elaine Mcpherson

Eileen Turnbull

Service Manager

Education Estate

