

CROSS PARTY GROUP ON MUSIC

Committee Room 6, Scottish Parliament

23 October, 2018

Present:

George Adam MSP	Jenna Main (ABRSM)
Tom Arthur MSP (Chair)	Carol Main (Live Music Now Scotland)
Adam Behr (Newcastle Univ./ Live Music Exchange)	Alan Morrison (Creative Scotland)
Jo Buckley (Dunedin Consort)	Mae Murray (MEPG)
Kenny Christie (HITS)	Rab Noakes (Musician/MU Exec)
Tam Coyle (SMIA)	Dougal Perman (SMIA)
Allan Dumbreck (UWS)	Kirk Richardson (EIS)
Lois Fitch (RCS)	Caroline Sewell (MU)
David Francis (Traditional Music Forum)	Jane Stanley (Glasgow Univ.)
Olaf Furniss (Born to be Wide/ Music Tourist)	Nick Stewart (Sneaky Pete's/ MVT)
Amy Geddes (Musician/ Teacher)	Adam Tomkins MSP
Jim Hollington (EIF)	John Wallace (MEPG)
Robert Kilpatrick (SMIA)	Matthew Whiteside (The Night With...)

Key: ABRSM = Associated Boards of the Royal Schools of Music; EIF = Edinburgh International Festival; EIS = Educational Institute of Scotland; HITS = Heads of Instrumental Teaching Scotland; MEPG = Music Education Partnership Group; MU = Musicians' Union; MVT = Music Venues Trust; NYOS = National Youth Orchestra of Scotland; RCS = Royal Conservatoire of Scotland; SMIA = Scottish Music Industry Association; UWS = University of the West of Scotland

Apologies received from:

Stuart McMillan MSP, Gordon Lindhurst MSP, Pauline McNeill MSP, Rachael Hamilton MSP, Jennifer Laidler (MU), Matt Brennan (Glasgow University), Ralph Riddiough, Nick Zekulin (NYOS), Ally Gray (Emu Bands), Yvonne McLellan (Lost Art Agency), Lisa Whytock (Active), David Scott (University of West of Scotland), Luke McCullough (BBC Scotland)

1. Approval of Minutes of Last Meeting

One point from Richard Knowles (EIS) had been missed. He had asked for cross-party agreement in support for statutory status for instrumental music education, and directed this at the whole group and not just the Chair. TA pointed out that 'cross-party sympathy' would more accurately describe the situation at this stage. With this addition the minutes were approved.

2. Matters Arising

- a) It had proved difficult to secure space in the Parliament Garden Lobby for the event proposed at the previous meeting. However, TA had been asked to sponsor an event

for the Association of British Orchestras, and now planned to use that event to highlight the work of the CPG.

- b) The decision at the previous meeting to send a letter to the Brexit authorities had been made in the 'pre-Chequers' era, which has brought greater uncertainty about outcomes. Proposed to remit for further discussion in the next agenda item.

3. Brexit Implications

Olaf Furniss: Wide Days has a Showcase component which presents seven Scottish acts. Increasingly they have been receiving requests from organisations abroad wishing to present international acts at Wide Days. The next event is scheduled for 12 and 13 April. Will international acts be able to come, and will Scottish acts be able to **travel**? The present situation is stifling opportunity.

Rab Noakes: Are we going to be left out of negotiations with the European Parliament when it comes to determining how musicians are to be paid for their **intellectual property**?

Caroline Sewell: The MU has a number of strong positions on Brexit which it has outlined in a paper which CS will circulate to the group.

Carol Main: The Creative Industries Federation also has a paper 'What Would a No Deal Brexit Look Like?' CM will circulate the link.

Allan Dumbreck: Brexit has already had an impact. There has already been a drop-off of 20-25% in applications due to uncertainty.

Adam Behr: There are also question marks over access to European research funding.

Tom Arthur: How best to mitigate these effects? What opportunities might there be?

CS: There needs to be **reciprocal and free work permits**, applications for which are resource-light and speedily processed. It needs to be as close to the current situation as possible.

OF: Festivals and cultural events are already having problems.

Amy Geddes: Costs are becoming prohibitive. There are also problems for musicians coming for educational reasons as well as to perform.

Jim Hollington: EIF has been working with the Creative Industries Federation. He would be happy to share some of the lines of discussion.

TA: Given the reappraisals of migration policy taking place, are there any areas outwith Europe where there are opportunities for Scottish musicians?

OF: Canada is an open door at the moment. There is a willingness there to work with Scottish acts. Australia is another possibility.

Alan Morrison: The diaspora takes us to these places, but travel costs to and from them are a concern. Showcase Scotland targeted Australia and New Zealand earlier this year and found them very welcoming.

TA: Should we be making representations about an export strategy? What should that look like?

AM: Recently attended a British Council meeting with the music industry. It was clear at that that the British Council's target countries are not Scotland's. The DCMS has earmarked China, India, Saudi Arabia.

OF: Germany is a key market among others. We shouldn't lose sight of those.

Dougal Perman: People have to get on with business. People are still booking acts. We can't wait. We need to be looking for opportunities in individual countries.

TA: How much differentiation between Scotland and the rest of the UK does there have to be?

DP: We can certainly look to the diaspora and Germany, but he had met people from India and Brazil who were passionate about Scottish music.

TA: How do we make sure that Scotland's voice is heard at UK level post-Brexit?

OF: We should work to maintain a **distinctive Scottish identity**. There is already a strong perception of Scotland being different. Scottish parties are often very popular at expos!

AM: When it comes to differentiation these are concerns around genre. The approach to traditional music is different to that to jazz, classical and rock music. But at WOMEX, for example, Scotland is part of a UK and Ireland presence (the only example of that). He has the sense that the interest is more in Scotland as a separate cultural identity.

AD: There is a perception among European universities that Scotland is more willing to work with Europe post-Brexit. People are making Erasmus agreements on that basis.

TA: There is a need for the **Scottish music industry to have its own distinctive voice**. He would like to see our aspirations distilled down to three key asks. Would anyone like to attempt that?

OF: The visa issue...

Adam Tomkins. He had experience of going to the UK government with asks. They are more receptive if specific Scottish needs can be identified. The visa issue is not a specifically Scottish issue. The value to add is specific Scottish needs. There will be frameworks that include Scottish needs.

Lois Fitch: She would like to see a **targeted scholarship scheme to encourage European students to come to Scotland**, and not only to study STEM subjects. The cultural argument is as important as any other. In a recent poll of European students 56% said they would not have come to Scotland to study if the UK were not in the EU.

AT: The music scene in Glasgow and Edinburgh is more dependent on festivals than provincial English cities. If there are visa difficulties for festivals which are important for these cities' economy, then that could be a way in.

AM: Because we don't have a sustainable touring circuit or label infrastructure in Scotland there is a risk that a talent drain to London becomes more likely.

CS: Away from the cities rural-based micro-businesses are now faced with yet another barrier to sustainability.

DP: As well as **talent retention international collaboration** is an issue. There is a need to find a way to keep international collaboration going.

Matthew Whiteside: is concerned about royalty streams from countries abroad once Brexit happens.

OF: Part of Wide Days is about connecting European and Scottish *artists* as well as managers and bookers.

TA: proposed that key asks are distilled from the discussion, focussing on Scotland-only concerns which can be communicated to the UK government. This was agreed. **Action Point**

4. Instrumental Music Service/ What's Going On Now research

John Wallace reported that MEPG has brought together COSLA and the Scottish Government to consider changes in policy towards instrumental tuition, especially with regard to charging. The Education and Skills Committee is undertaking an enquiry into charging, which has attracted a lot of media attention. They are looking for written evidence from public and other bodies, are consulting young people and carrying out some research in North Lanarkshire.

The *What's Going on Now* research is now drawing to a close, and the team are considering how much of that to share at an early stage. The hope is that the findings will support a

compromise that might stem cuts through to the next Parliament. There are still exemplars of good practice to draw on.

TA: Is there the sense of a realistic ask for the 2021 election campaign?

JW: Things would change at a stroke if music instruction was made statutory, and there is cross-party support for this.

TA: What is the perception of attitudes to music education?

JW: Council leaders and Directors of Education get it. The problem is the hard choices that councils have to make. The further down the bureaucracies you go, the more attitudes harden. Instrumental teaching, unlike maths, for example, is one thing that can be charged for. Sometimes it is the ability to charge that actually saves the service. However, there are degrees of acceptability. £150 in North Lanarkshire is affordable. £524 p.a. in Clackmannan is not sustainable.

TA: How easy is it to get a balance between quantity and quality?

JW: YMI has been successful in terms of quantity. It builds an appetite for access to excellence.

CS: We need to be aware of the wider impact of instrumental service cuts on the wider industry. If there is not a generation coming through who have achieved excellence there will be problems. Scottish orchestras already rely on European musicians.

DP: If the industry does not have the talent to work with then that is a bad situation.

AM: The current annual YMI report is at the draft stage. There is good evidence there that attainment in other subjects is better if pupils have musical experience.

DP: The Sistema research shows similar findings.

Kenny Christie: YMI is great. 240,000 children get music but it only amounts to 11 hours across the school year. The Instrumental Music Service is necessary to complement YMI, to open up pathways of progression.

Kirk Richardson: If 240,000 actually want to go on and study music then there are no resources to accommodate them. Charging is actively discouraging for parents in the squeezed middle.

CM: Could this be a standing item for each meeting?

This was **agreed**.

5. Agent of Change

Nick Stewart The Planning Bill is currently at Stage 2. The Minister would like to introduce a duty to have regard to venues in the legislation. There are three amendments related to the Agent of Change principle, one from the Minister, Kevin Stewart and one from Adam Tomkins. Lewis Macdonald's proposes the idea of the Culturally Significant Zone, of which developers must be made aware. 'Culture' is a vague term, and there is a reluctance to specify music but it may be useful. The amendment includes the idea of a 100m zone around the venue, but it might be more useful simply to offer protection to the music venue. Adam Tomkins's specifies that local authorities may not impose conditions on existing venues.

AT: The Bill is currently at the scrutiny stage, where amendments can be brought with the support of four of the seven person committee. The current amendments could be improved, but there is to be no further debate on Stage 2 amendments. There is to be a vote on the amendments on October 24. They will go into the Bill if approved, after which they can be polished. There is cross-party support for the Agent of Change principle, but it needs to be implemented in law. There needs to be a tie between law and guidance and policy notes.

RN: saw this debate within the context of gentrification. The people who complain are not chasing out music but the people who make and enjoy it.

NS: Gentrification often follows the establishment of music venues.

DP: What can this group do?

AT: The Group can help with expertise on its experience with these issues.

TA: The Planning Bill is a substantive piece of legislation for this Parliament. There is a clear desire to achieve Agent of Change outcomes but the wording of the legislation has to be right.

NS: Scotland will be a first for the UK if this goes through. It will look good and this group should celebrate it.

OF: Has there been any thought about the definition of a music venue.

NS: A definition of a music venue might be useful. It could be based on the Music Venue Trust's definition of a 'grassroots' music venue.

OF: This hopefully opens up the possibility of new venues coming up where previous venues have closed down.

AB: The 'Culturally Significant Zone' might answer that question.

NS: Good sound-proofing makes good neighbours. The Agent of Change principle cuts both ways.

6. European Music Council

CM introduced the European Music Council's Agenda for Music and tabled copies of the document.

7. AOCB

OF: drew attention to the Off the Record event at the National Museum for Scotland on 17 November.

NS: The Music Venues Trust has been holding regional venues days. One topic that has come up is the idea that venues are sites of R and D for the music industry. Given that the industry might do more, and MVT has made a statement of its intention to lobby the music industry to establish a pipeline development fund.

8. Dates of next meetings

January 15: tbc – dependent on the timing of the release of the What's Going on Now report

April 2

June 25

Sept 10