

**Draft minute of the meeting of the**  
**Cross Party Group on Men's Violence Against Women and Children**  
**5 September 2018, 17.30 – 19.30, Scottish Parliament, Committee Room 5**

**1. Present/Apologies**

**Present**

**CPG Members**

- Claire Baker MSP (chair) (CBa)
- Johann Lamont MSP (JL)
- John Finnie MSP (co-chair) (JF)
- Amy Johnson – Zero Tolerance (AJ)
- Ania Kinross – Scottish Women's Aid (AK)
- Brenna Jessie – Scottish Women's Aid (BJ)
- Davy Thompson – White Ribbon Scotland (DT)
- Emily Beever – The Empower Project Scotland (EB)
- Emma Ritch – Engender (ER)
- Hazel Loeb – Pilton Community Health Project (HL)
- Lily Greenan – Individual (LG)
- Louise Johnson – Scottish Women's Aid (LJ)
- Marsha Scott – Scottish Women's Aid (MS)
- Melanie McCarry – Strathclyde University (MMC)
- Orlaith McAree – Pilton Community Health Project (OMA)
- Pam Hunter – SAY Women (PH)
- Paula Mitchell – Individual (PM)
- Rahnuma Feist-Hassan – The Empower Project Scotland (RFH)

**Invited Guest**

- Christina McKelvie MSP – Minister for Older People and Equalities (CMK)

**Non-Member Visitors**

- Jenny Gilruth MSP
- Erin Mwebo (YWCA Scotland, Young Women Lead)
- Halla Gunnarsdóttir (Individual)
- Kate Robinson (Voluntary Action Fund)
- Katherine Gilmour (Church of Scotland)
- Kelly Johnson (Individual)
- Leah McCabe (PhD student)
- Tammy Connell (Individual)
- Trevor Owen (Scottish Government)

## Apologies

- Claudia Beamish MSP (CBe)
- Rhoda Grant MSP
- Rona Mackay MSP
- Tavish Scott MSP
- Ann Hayne – NHS Lanarkshire, EVA Services
- George Eckton – Individual
- Rachel Adamson – Zero Tolerance
- Sarah Weldon – Forensic Services, Glasgow

## 2. Thematic session: Online Abuse and VAWG

A. Online Abuse as cyberVAWG: presentation by Marsha Scott (SWA) – see Appendix 1 attached.

Following the presentation, MS suggested as a follow-up action to look at Scottish Government creating a legislative protection for victims of online abuse.

B. Online Harassment and Hate Crime: presentation by Emma Ritch (Engender) – see Appendix 2 attached.

Following the presentation, ER suggested as a follow-up action to look at creating a stand-alone law criminalising misogyny, rather than adding misogyny as an aggravator in gender-based hate crimes.

C. Young people and online abuse: presentation by Emily Beever (Empower Project) – see Appendix 3 attached.

D. Address by Minister for Older People and Equalities

CMK thanked the group's members and attendees for their support to the CPG, which she has previously been member of for over 10 years. She also thanked everyone for the invitation to attend the meeting in her new capacity. On her part, CMK would like to address the following issues in the context of online abuse and VAWG more broadly:

- Which legislative changes are possible within the scope of devolved powers
- Flagging up the issue of gender hostility to Cabinet Secretary for Justice
- Looking at outcomes from the Public Sector Equality Duty (PSED) review and the TIE campaign
- In the context of the Hate Crime legislation review – the case for standalone misogyny crime as opposed to gender as an aggravator
- Addressing unconscious bias in education – as discussed at the previous CPG meeting with the Cabinet Secretary for Education and Skills

As a chair of the Equally Safe Joint Strategic Board, CMK will also be responsible for moving the implementation forward. Later in the year, CMK would also like to organise a roundtable discussion on online abuse and misogyny, and would like to invite members of the group to join in. CMK finished her address by stressing that the First Minister is committed to and would like to see a gender equality approach to issues across the board.

The thematic session was followed by a discussion, with the following themes emerging:

- YP needs as individuals engaging in consensual relationships: more spaces to discuss relationships and consent with adults of the same gender; concerns about criminalisation and/or being reported by a 3<sup>rd</sup> party; legal age of consent within the current cultural context
- Existing gaps: inadequate provision of mental health services, particularly for YP; lack of education, tailored provision and engagement with minoritised YP; insufficient data and evidence (particularly Scotland-based and gendered research)
- Online harassment and cyberVAWG as an intergenerational issue: balance between non-criminalising YP and sanctions for perpetrators; protection for young women without losing sight of the impact on all generations; best approach to prevention, incl. education and legislation

### **3. Cross-Party Group business**

#### **A. Action points from the thematic session:**

- a. Systematic review that would compare the existing criminal and civil law, and its implementation, with women's experience of harassment, and identify any gaps in remedy (ER).
- b. Data gathering: suggested sources include: Scottish Children's Reporters Administration and Crown Office (LJ), HM Inspectorate of Education, and Care Commission (PM). MMC suggested using the [Equally Safe toolkit](#). CMK pointed to the recommendations from the ["It's not cool to be cruel" report](#) and SEEMiS, both identifying the need for improved data collection, the [report by Ethel Quayle, University of Edinburgh](#) was suggested (LJ), existing reports by STAMP Project and Girl Guides, Scottish Government's data on gendered work (CMK). A data review by SGov is needed so that gaps can be addressed.
- c. MS added that fulfilling actions from the previous thematic session would allow for improved data collection.

#### **B. Approval of Minutes: minutes of CPG May 30 2018 were approved (proposed by MS and seconded by PM).**

#### **C. Matters arising from minutes:**

- a. MS thanked everyone who has commented on the draft of suggested actions for the attention of Cabinet Secretary for Education & Skills. The comments will be incorporated as possible into the draft and distributed with the minutes of the current meeting. MS also expressed her gratitude to the office bearers in advance for helping to bring the actions to the attention of the Cabinet Secretary.

**Action:** MS to finalise the draft, AK to circulate it with the meeting minutes.

- b. December session on work with perpetrators and men's role in challenging other men to be led jointly by Rory Macrae and Davy Thompson.

D. Confirmation/Approval of new members: new members have been unanimously approved

- a. YWCA Scotland, Young Women Lead, represented by Erin Mwebo, committee member
- b. Church of Scotland, represented by Katherine Gilmour, Gender Justice Officer
- c. Tammy Connell (Individual)
- d. Kelly Johnson (Individual)
- e. Nikki Dillon (Individual)

E. Members' updates

- a. Zero Tolerance: a free exhibition called "Violence Unseen" is currently open to the public in the Stills Gallery, Edinburgh, until 9<sup>th</sup> September
- b. Paula Mitchell: the first meeting of CPG on Women's Justice will take place on 19<sup>th</sup> September from 6 till 8 pm.
- c. Scottish Women's Aid: spaces are still available at the "What about the men?" seminar on 11<sup>th</sup> September

F. AOCB

- a. MS: future dates (2019) for the meetings will be agreed with the office bearers and circulated to the members in advance.

**Action:** CBe, CBa, JF and SWA to liaise about future meeting dates.

#### 4. Date and time of the next meetings

- December 5<sup>th</sup> 5.30-7pm