

CPG Commercial Sexual Exploitation Meeting

Scottish Parliament

AGM

10th March 2020

18.00-20.00

Minutes

Apologies

| | |
|-----------------|----------------------------|
| Jeremy Balfour | MSP |
| Janice Wilson | Soroptimist Scotland North |
| Stephanie Beard | Student |
| Linda Thompson | Women's Support project |
| Siobhan Jess | Nordic Model Now |
| Pam Hunter | Say-Women |
| Chris Hall | Not for Sale Scotland |
| Susan Moffat | Individual |
| Steve Rawbone | Volunteer for SOHTIS |
| Ruth Maguire | MSP (Co-Convener) |
| Rhoda Grant | MSP (Co-Convener) |

Attendances

| | |
|-------------------|-----------------------------|
| Teresa Little | Individual |
| Bryan Little | Individual |
| Janet Warren | Graduate Women Scotland |
| Marlyn Glen | Individual |
| Beverley Johnston | Salvation Army |
| Ann Hall | Not for Sale Scotland |
| Shairi Bowes | Scottish Women's Convention |
| Anna Zobnina | Migrant Women Network |
| John Mason | MSP |
| Johann Lamont | MSP |

Joan McAlpine MSP (Co-Convener)

Jacci Stoyle ACTS (Secretariat)

Minutes

Apologies and agreeing the Minutes of the previous meeting.

Joan McAlpine opened the meeting and the Apologies were read out as listed above. She asked if the group could approve the Minutes of the previous meeting (19/11/19). They were proposed by Ann Hall, seconded by Janet Warren and unanimously approved.

Updates from the Conveners on any progress towards legislation and the forthcoming consultation on prostitution and on the progress of the exhibition.

Joan McAlpine apologised and said she was not able to give updates on any of these pending issues.

Linda Thomson presenting an evaluation of the Outcome Four Conference.

Unfortunately, Linda was unable to attend due to unforeseen circumstances. She had very kindly sent the group a written summary (see below). In addition, Beverley Johnston had attended the Conference and gave us her helpful evaluation of the day.

Outcome Four Conference

We had around 140 attendees from across Scotland and sectors –

Health advisors, housing workers, VAW leads and services, health projects and support services, police, lawyers and activists.

The programme was as follows:

| | |
|--|--|
| 9:30 | Arrival Tea and coffee available |
| 9:45 | Welcome and scene setting Dr Isabelle Kerr Men's Voices – readings from "Memoirs" |
| The links between different forms of Commercial Sexual Exploitation | |
| 10:00 | The Scottish context and the Scottish Government approach to CSE Ash Denham, Minister for Community Safety |
| 10:20 | From conducive contexts to conducive cultures: framings for making sense of men's engagements with sex industries |

| | |
|--------------|---|
| | <p>Prof Liz Kelly, Director of the Child and Woman Abuse Studies Unit (CWASU)</p> <p>Dr Maria Garner</p> |
| 11:00 | <p>What do the punters know: a study with buyers of sex in 5 European countries*</p> <p>EC ISEC project: Tackling demand for sexual services of trafficked women and girls (Yonkova and Keegan, 2014)</p> <p>Dr.Nusha Yonkova, Gender & Anti-trafficking expert, Immigrant Council of Ireland</p> |
| 11:30 | Break |
| 11:40 | Table discussion |
| 12:30 | Lunch |
| | |

| | |
|---|--|
| Tackling Commercial Sexual Exploitation | |
| 13:20 | "Andrea" by Ruhama |
| 13:30 | <p>"Creating new conversations with men"</p> <p>Sean Cooke, CEO of The Men's Development Network</p> |
| 14:00 | <p>"The French experience of moving to a change in the legislation"</p> <p>Claire Quidet, President of Mouvement du N id-France, Secretary General of CAP International</p> |
| 14:30 | <p>'Operation Outgoing' – a Glasgow pilot to tackle demand</p> <p>Danny Clark Police Scotland</p> |
| 15:00 | Table discussion |
| Scotland's future direction and priorities | |
| 15:30 | <p>The way ahead</p> <p>Councillor Elena Whitham, COSLA</p> |

| | |
|--------------|---------------------------------------|
| | |
| 15:45 | Evaluation Dr Isabelle Kerr |
| 16:00 | Close |

Key points

Ash Denham opened the event with a commitment from the Scottish Government to move forward on this issue. This commitment is contained in Equally Safe and also in the Programme for Government. She also announced the Government would be providing a new fund of £100,000 which will be available for innovation in challenging demand and improving front line services.

Liz Kelly said that we create conducive cultures and contexts for sexual exploitation to take place but it is not inevitable that prostitution must take place. Therefore, we can change this social practice. The impact of the sex industry is not just about individuals but the wider message it sends around value of women and inequality.

Maria Garner spoke about her PhD research with men around their views of sexualisation including pornography and prostitution.

Nusha Yonkova highlighted the research with purchasers of sex across Europe. One of the most striking parts was what would deter men from purchasing sex. Purchasers were most concerned about their own risk of disease followed by the fear of criminalisation and / or the idea that their actions may be made public, so their own reputation. The idea that she may be trafficked or exploited had no impact on the buyer's behaviour. Nusha's presentation suggested that challenging demand should focus on what concerns men the most and interventions like Community John Schools have the least impact.

Sean Cooke from the Men's Development Network spoke about how they have engaged with men and made them active. He linked this work to notions of masculinity and how to get men on board. We have to directly challenge and confront ideas. We were delighted that Sean was able to give us a sneak preview of the <https://wedontbuyit.eu/> Campaign

Claire Quidet spoke on the process behind legislative change and how laws are only effective when implemented and that the will and desire of large and powerful male dominated systems need to be on board. She spoke about the backlash and how there were organised campaigns to overturn the law in France. It requires constant attention and campaigning to embed it into expectations and attitudes.

Police Scotland were due to give an input into the event on *Operation Outgoing*, a local partnership operation in Glasgow, which aimed to fully implement the laws from the Public

Places Act in terms of targeting kerb crawlers. Police Scotland pulled out at the last minute and Kirsty Hay from Glasgow VAW partnership kindly stepped in to take their place.

Elena Whitham from COSLA spoke about the journey Scotland must take and that now is the time to make the connections between our attitudes, our culture and all forms of violence against women. We must look at what is fuelling issues like sexual harassment, sexual objectification etc and see that the sex industry has a major role to play.

Feedback was very positive on the day for such a varied programme and the need to start to have these courageous conversations with a lot of questioning as to why this particular area of VAW has been treated so differently.

What next?

We are reviewing all the delegates feedback and comments etc and tabletop discussion notes. At an initial glance there is a real sense for prevention and education work with boys, and men, both young and older and a need for men to step up and become involved, a sense that we need to move towards holding men accountable. An evaluation report will be made available to all who attended and interested parties.

CPG comments

Joan McAlpine said that Pornhub had donated \$50,000 to the sex worker community promoting full decriminalisation. The group discussed the influence of pornography on the attitudes of men and women, particularly young people and how pornography was positioned as being 'harmless' to view and sex work to be 'empowering' for women. The group decided that a future meeting on pornography would be helpful.

Anna Zobnina presenting on the current work of the European Network of Migrant Women.

Migrant women are over-represented in the sex trade. Currently, there are 90% of migrant women in Germany's sex trade; over 60% are trafficked from EU member states. Trafficking and prostitution overlap with forced marriages, which is rife in the refugee camps in Greece. There is a lot of trade in girls in Greece, where they are moved around, trafficking doesn't have to be across borders.

The European Women's Lobby comprises of over 1,500 women's organisations and is committed to an abolitionist approach to prostitution. In 1999, Sweden passed the Sex Purchase Act (better known as the Nordic Model) and deconstructed the myths about prostitution. For a while the campaign for a Europe free from prostitution lay dormant, but now there is a website, *Brussels Call*, which is campaigning to implement the Nordic Model.

There are two important things which need our attention: firstly, the CEDAW Convention and secondly Beijing + 25.

The CEDAW Convention

This is the most ratified convention in the world. It is an internationally binding document and has 18 articles and No. 6 deals with the trafficking of women and girls. CEDAW has a

committee attached to it, which receives reports from the states which have signed the treaty and then issues recommendations.

With regard to Article 6 on prostitution and sex trafficking, Anna told us, 'they didn't want to open the floodgates, but it happened'. Almost all the UN agencies have replaced the phrase 'prostitution and trafficking' with 'sex work.' CEDAW are supposed to be independent, but there has been a lot of lobbying on the part of organised crime on UN agencies.

The *Walk Free Foundation* promotes the concept of Modern Slavery, which has no legal meaning, but which constitutes sexual exploitation as a form of labour. It erases the lines of prostitution as *exploitation*, because it becomes just another form of 'work'. This is promoted globally. Asking CEDAW to talk about demand is to recognise that demand is itself a driver.

Beijing+25

There are 2 documents, which should go hand in hand, *The Beijing Declaration*, which has 12 critical areas on VAW and *The Beijing Platform for Action*, which sets out to achieve women's rights. The UN Women are an agency which reviews and appraises the implementation of the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action. Recently they had their 25th anniversary and decided to bring their local funders on board. The Gates Foundation supports global prostitution and the Open Society Foundation, created by George Soros, produces materials to undermine the Nordic Model. These massive funders are backing the review of the Beijing Declaration. We need to lobby UN Women to stop collaborating with the big funders. They must comply with a zero-tolerance approach to exploitation.

What role will the Scottish Government be playing? Where is the UK with this?

There is a convention in July; can we write to the Scottish and UK Governments raising our concerns as a CPG?

Joan McAlpine asked if Anna and Jaci (secretariat) could work together to write two letters: one to CEDAW and one to the Scottish Government regarding the Beijing Declaration.

AOB

Rhoda Grant was not present to update the group on the recent Human Trafficking CPG and the ongoing developments of the Human Trafficking Strategy.

Next Meeting

All CPG meetings have been suspended till further notice due to COVID-19. Consequently, the meeting on the 24th June has been cancelled and members will be notified of the date of the next meeting by email.