

CROSS PARTY GROUP ON MUSIC

Room Q1.03, Scottish Parliament

29 January 2019

Present:

George Adam MSP	Morag Macdonald (Creative Scotland)
Claire Adamson MSP	Jenna Main (ABRSM)
Tom Arthur MSP (Chair)	Carol Main (Live Music Now Scotland)
Adam Behr (Newcastle Univ./ Live Music Exchange)	Mae Murray (MEPG)
Matt Brennan (Univ of Glasgow)	Kirk Richardson (EIS)
Kenny Christie (HITS)	Caroline Sewell (MU)
Allan Dumbreck (UWS)	Nick Stewart (Sneaky Pete's/ MVT)
Lois Fitch (RCS)	John Wallace (MEPG)
David Francis (Traditional Music Forum)	Matthew Whiteside (The Night With...)
Rachael Hamilton MSP	Andy Wightman MSP

In attendance: Stephen Broad (RCS)

Key: ABRSM = Associated Boards of the Royal Schools of Music; EIF = Edinburgh International Festival; EIS = Educational Institute of Scotland; HITS = Heads of Instrumental Teaching Scotland; MEPG = Music Education Partnership Group; MU = Musicians' Union; MVT = Music Venues Trust; NYOS = National Youth Orchestra of Scotland; RCS = Royal Conservatoire of Scotland; SMIA = Scottish Music Industry Association; UWS = University of the West of Scotland

Apologies received from:

Caroline Sewell (MU), Robert Kirkpatrick (SMIA), Lois Fitch (RCS), Donald Finlayson (HITS), Alison Reeves (Making Music), Jenny Kemp (EIS), Amy Geddes, Rab Noakes (MU), Gordon Lindhurst MSP, Jo Buckley (Dunedin Consort), Ally Grey (Emubands), Luke McCullough (BBC), Sharon Mair (BBC), Nick Zekulin (NYOS), Gill Maxwell (Scottish Music Centre), Lisa Whytock (Active), Mae Murray (MEPG), Ralph Riddiough

1. Approval of Minutes of Last Meeting

Moved: Carol Main, Seconded: John Wallace

2. Matters Arising

The proposed letter from the CPG to David Lidington, the Cabinet Office Minister in the UK Government, was somewhat overtaken by events and it was agreed that any communication would be deferred until the final form of the Withdrawal Agreement became clearer.

3. What's Going On Now

The Chair introduced John Wallace, chair of the Music Education Partnership Group, and Prof. Stephen Broad, the chief researcher on the What's Going On Now (WGON) project. JW noted that SB had been a key researcher on the predecessor to the current work in 2002-3. Commenting on the recent report on music education by the Parliament Education and Skills Committee, he commented that it went further than expected, noting that the report endorsed the local authorities as the best system of delivery as against a national, centralised system, and that there was cross-party support for the abolition of fees for instrumental music tuition. He also noted that a joint MEPG/COSLA guidance document was to be brought to the COSLA board, outlining good practice for local authorities and urging that we maintain what we have. Before handing over to SB, JW pointed out that there had been a delay in publishing the WGON report due to a need to make the recommendations as pragmatic as possible.

Stephen Broad explained that the work contained four research areas and offered five recommendations. He outlined the methodology of the work which involved compiling data on music education, conducting a large-scale qualitative and quantitative survey and carrying out case studies and detailed mapping in Perth and Kinross, Shetland and North East Glasgow, with the aim of drawing the strands together and triangulating the information at the end of the process.

The data context had changed massively since 2002 when there was comparatively little information available. The figures show that there has been a small uplift overall in numbers receiving instrumental music tuition (IMS), but nationally the proportion has remained roughly the same, at 8-9%. The conclusion drawn, however, is that what drives numbers is not demand but supply. Demand exceeds supply to the extent that it is estimated that there are over 100,000 young people who would take music lessons but do not. There is considerable variation across local authorities. The median fee for IMS has doubled in 15 years (from £100 to £200), but participation stays the same – another indicator that demand exceeds supply.

In terms of uptake of National Qualifications music holds its own against other subjects, e.g. computing and business studies. Music is the sixth most popular Advanced Higher.

Rachael Hamilton: Were people more likely to take advantage of music tuition if it is free?

SB: There is no information on that. There is no consistent approach to inclusivity, although anecdotally it looks as though numbers stay the same but post-codes change.

Carol Main: is there information about uptake of particular instruments?

SB: There was no information on this that came out of the research. The Improvement Service has some related information, but on the Full Time Equivalent numbers of particular instrumental teachers rather than on particular instruments.

In terms of the survey, the team re-used the basic categories of stakeholder from 2002 (tutors, teachers, organisers, co-ordinators, i.e. people with an investment in music education). In 2002, there were 450 survey responses, in 2018 1400, with the largest group of respondents teachers, tutors and mentors, over a third of whom with 25 or more years experience, and over half of whom are working as professional musicians. There were 430 responses from young people (mostly in the 18-25 age range).

The case studies consisted of wide-ranging interviews. A key theme was the centrality of the school as a place where inequalities can be levelled. It was with the case studies that ideas began to emerge and align with the survey results. Four areas of concern were identified: inequalities; perceptions of music and its purpose; music in the school; facilitating opportunities and experiences. These were taken forward into a series of recommendations:

1. Inequalities: Music Services should work together to create a genuinely common approach to inequalities and inclusion – within the lifetime of the next Scottish Parliament.
2. Pathways: Music is a viable way to make a living. There should be a dialogue with all key agencies to ensure that National Qualifications provide a progression route.
3. Perceptions: Resources should be reinforced for understanding the benefits and value of music
4. Music in the School: There should be collaborations between collaborations between MEPG and Education Scotland to develop a programme of activity, building on YMI.
5. Experiences and Opportunities: the sector should be strengthened through increased partnership working

Andy Wightman: Are there exemplar local authorities in Scotland or elsewhere?

SB: It is difficult to identify these because of the sheer variety of activity across all 32 authorities.

JW: There will be a short version of the report available.

TA undertook to try to find time for a debate in Parliament, which would give the Government the opportunity to respond.

CM: How does the stability in numbers stack up against the reduction in services?

Kenny Christie: Perhaps the question we should be asking is why we are not further on.

JW: The number of teachers looks static because numbers went up between 2002 and 2008 before being cut back.

Allan Dumbreck: Is there any correlation between music study and attainment?

SB: That question was unfortunately outside the scope of the research.

Morag Macdonald: YMI has done some research which has shown some correlation between music, health and well-being.

SB: There has been other good research on the instrumental value of music. RCS has produced a literature review on this topic.

KC: Dundee looked at data P7 to S3, which showed a correlation between music participation and an increase in numeracy in particular.

Kirk Richardson: Once you might have had a faculty of 80 serving 1000 pupils. Now you have a faculty of 40 serving 3000 pupils.

SB: That is borne out by the research.

KR: The quality of lessons is going down. There is a lot more group teaching now.

KC: The last couple of years have been much better from the point of view of identifying good practice. There are better networks and effective sharing of learning through the likes of HITS and MEPG.

Claire Adamson: The Education and Skills Committee was careful not single out good and bad practice, preferring to place more emphasis on inequality and lack of consistency.

KR: A key issue is that instrumental music is seen as being somehow separate from education. At council level it gets bracketed with buses and lollipop ladies.

TA: Looking to the future we need to nurture creativity in the light of the coming wide-scale automation.

Nick Stewart: If we want to see the outcomes flagged up in the National Performance Framework then the funding to make them happen must be provided.

TA: Thanked Stephen Broad and said that we must capitalise on the interest the report will generate, through the likes of the Education and Skills Committee and the Cross Party Group.

4. Streaming

TA introduced Matthew Whiteside.

MW described how he made an album which no one bought, which led him to explore how streaming could be a viable model for him. He pointed out that Radio 3 will pay around £150 for a 5 minute piece (based on a combination of PPL and PRS payments), while streaming (e.g. Spotify) pays per play with payment triggered at 30 seconds. The way Spotify works is that the revenues are pooled: if you pay £9.99 a month for your subscription, and play one track in that month, triggering 1p in royalty, the remaining £9.98 goes into a pot. The model has recently been prey to the so-called 'Bulgarian scam' (not actually illegal), where an enterprising person created a playlist of hundreds of titles most of which were just over 30 seconds in length. 1200 specially created premium accounts played all of the hundreds of titles on a loop generating approximately half a million dollars per playlist, thereby drawing royalties from the pool that might have been earmarked for legitimate artists.

Streaming discriminates against long-form pieces because of the 30 second trigger. A user-centric system would be fairer and niche artists would benefit as explored through a study involving the Finnish Music Publishers' Association, the Musicians' Union, the Finnish Society of Composers and Lyricists, and the Society of Finnish Composers in 2016. TA: Is it a case of the medium influencing how the music is created?

MW: The average length of a song has reduced from 3 minutes 50 seconds to 3 minutes 20 seconds.

JW: Are royalties not covered by international agreements?

MW: Royalties are controlled by ICE Services, the royalty collection agencies like PRS. Record labels deal directly or through an aggregation service such as CD Baby with Youtube and Spotify. PPL does not deal with streaming.

Adam Behr: It seems that there is not much we can do about it in Scotland since it is a question of international agreements.

MW: The flow of royalties is not the issue. It is how the royalties are triggered in the first place.

NS: We shouldn't neglect the role of streaming as a way of discovering new music. Music that is played more should get paid more.

Matt Brennan: There is no consensus on what constitutes fair remuneration between composers, authors, and songwriters.

AB: How can Scotland help members of collection organisations and support people to respond to changes in business models?

TA: Public bodies can support artists. The more informed opinion is expressed through the Cross Party Group the better informed MSPs will be. The CPG can be a voice feeding through to trade bodies and internationally.

TA thanked MW for his presentation.

5. AOCB

- a) Nick Stewart noted the recent closure of Coda Music.
- b) NS gave a brief note on the progress of the Planning Bill, including the tabling of an amendment to define what music venues are. There is a total of 390 amendments to get through.
- c) Carol Main urged more involvement from the National Companies in the CPG. The CEOs of the RSNO and the SCO should be added to the mailing list.
- d) Kenny Christie asked the CPG to commend the recent report by the Education and Skills Committee into instrumental music tuition in schools, particularly its scope and detail. Congratulations to the Parliament were in order for holding the enquiry and the speed with which it was concluded.

6. Date of Next Meeting

Set for April 2nd

