

DRAFT MINUTES. Corrections, if any, to [dg.elder@ntlworld.com](mailto:dg.elder@ntlworld.com)  
No later than May 16 please.

## **Meeting of the Cross Party Group on Chronic Pain, February 24, 2015**

This meeting was packed and included numerous patients, health professionals and six MSPs from four Parties.

Bill Kidd, MSP chaired and welcomed everyone.

**Minutes of the meeting of November 12, 2014** passed unanimously.

### **Patients' Rights to Complementary & Alternative therapies (CAM) on the NHS.**

Paulo Quadros addressed the meeting regarding his years of work on trying to get equality of access for patients on the NHS for CAM therapies. He found great difficulties over inequality, despite some CAM treatments being approved by the SIGN guidelines on Chronic Pain in 2013. A packed agenda was short of time and a discussion could be held in future.

### **The Centre for Integrative Care, (CIC) formerly known as Glasgow Homeopathic Hospital**

Dr Jacqueline Mardon, clinic lead at the CIC and Dr David Reilly, (the latter helped to create and design the hospital) outlined specialisation in chronic conditions, including Chronic Pain, Fibromyalgia, Multiple Sclerosis, Arthritis, ME, Parkinson's, Crohn's and Motor Neurone Disease. Dr Mardon showed pictures of the modern hospital, explaining it was custom built in 1999 to create beautiful, peaceful surroundings, including landscaped gardens. The hospital and its two outreach clinics in Lanarkshire enjoy almost 100% patient satisfaction reports and no reports of harm over the years.

Dr Reilly, Consultant in Integrative Care, outlined the Wellness Enhancement Learning (WEL) programme he runs in Scotland as part of a need to change NHS approach over "the epidemics of long term conditions" now being apparent and improve life quality.

### **Controversy over Health Board withdrawals closing two clinics and access to the CIC.**

Catherine Hughes and other CIC patients and supporters were vocal in condemnation of three Boards removing patients against their wishes because some Boards are against homeopathy, although the CIC uses other conventional methods. Ms Hughes pointed out that patients were being ignored entirely by Boards, citing that NHS Lanarkshire discarded an 80.6% overwhelming majority urging continuation of access. This meant the views of 4,800 people and 98 patients' organisations were ignored in a decision by only nine Board members. She said that the Board's decision to close two Lanarkshire CIC outreach clinics and access to the Glasgow hospital was "totally undemocratic". Several MSPs questioned this Board decision, and the meeting was told that Ian Welsh, CEO of the Alliance for Health & Social Care, Scotland, which represents over 900 organisations and individuals aiding chronic conditions, protested to the Health Secretary on February 17. Liberal Democrat Health spokesman Jim Hume MSP pledged that, like Mr. Welsh, he would also write,

requesting a moratorium and consideration of national funding to protect the hospital as a “national resource”. But it is now reduced to only four boards sending patients regularly.

(The two CIC doctors did not join in the Group’s discussion on this controversy because discussing individual health boards’ actions is apparently not allowed by officials. Some CPG members voiced concern over this.)

The meeting passed the following motion unanimously:  
proposed by patient member Catherine Hughes. Seconded: John Thomson.

**To request that the Cabinet Secretary for Health and Wellbeing and the Public Health Minister intervene urgently on behalf of Lanarkshire patients of the Centre for Integrative Care and two outreach clinics in Carluke and Coatbridge:**

- 1. To request the Cabinet Secretary calls an urgent moratorium on Lanarkshire Health Board's decision to prevent any new Lanarkshire patient referrals from March 31; with another existing estimated 977 outpatients due to end after their treatment courses finish.*
- 2. To call upon the Cabinet Secretary to consider the Scottish Government taking over direct funding of this hospital so that it remains open to patients throughout Scotland,*
- 3. To call upon the Scottish Government to investigate how Lanarkshire Health Board ignored their public consultation result of 80.6% of respondents for continuation of services and study the inadequacy of the Board's evidence, including their Equality and Diversity Impact Assessment which ignored Lanarkshire poverty and high death and illness rates.*
- 4. We fully support the Health and Social Care Alliance's request to you, also calling for a moratorium and to ensure a funding method can be found to secure a future for the hospital and emphasise that some unelected health boards now flout elected Scottish Government and Parliament policy on freedom of choice by withdrawing patients. This is not on cost grounds, both Lothian (earlier withdrawal) and Lanarkshire declared, but on their views against homeopathy. Clearly, the CIC is at risk of closure in the future, to the detriment of around 8,000 patients in Scotland overall.*

**Action:** Hon. Sec. DG Elder to send this motion to the health ministers and write a background briefing. (Sent: 25 Feb 2015)

**Update:** All replies from Govt to the CPG & MSPs do not address the above requests on a moratorium, direct funding and the public consultation issue but Government claims that there is no current plan to close the CIC. The matter is being pursued.

**Update:** Since this meeting, numerous MSPs have supported patients’ protests and the following have written to the Health Secretary: **Jim Hume Lib Dem** health spokesperson; **Jenny Marra, Scottish Labour** health spokesperson,

**Richard Baker, MSP (Lab) . Also, Alison McInnes MSP (Lib Dem) wrote to Lanarkshire HB's new CEO, Parliamentary motions were submitted by Elaine Smith MSP Lab, also parliamentary questions raised by MSPs Elaine Smith, Jim Hume, Jenny Marra, and Claudia Beamish.**

### **Lanarkshire Lignocaine patients**

Three patients attended again, thanking the CPG for taking up their case with public health minister Maureen Watt and Liz Porterfield who contacted Lanarkshire officials over Lignocaine infusions being delayed 2 – 14 weeks over their six week period at conventional treatment clinics in Lanarkshire due to staff shortages.

The patients are now being *promised* they'll receive treatment every six weeks but it was agreed with the patients that vigilance will still be needed. And we don't know about other Lignocaine patients who did not send complaints to the CPG.

### ATTENDANCE

#### MSPs

Bill Kidd, SNP; Neil Findlay Lab (co conveners) Jim Hume, Lib Dem, Jenny Marra, Lab, Annabel Goldie Con, Jamie McGrigor, Con.

#### NON MSPs

Dr David Reilly, Dr Jacqueline Mardon, Margaret McLucas, Dr Patricia Roche, Paulo Quadros, Catherine Hughes, Margaret Wyllie, Fiona-Frances Adam, Irene Logan, Susan Archibald, Fiona Robinson, Arlene Byrne, Geraldine McGuigan, John Thomson, Linda Mawson, Christine Martin, Prof. Tim Eden, Dr David J. Weeks, Kathleen Powderly, Liz Porterfield, Jeannie Erskine, Mairi O'Keefe, Margaret Coats, Ian Brogan, Denise Clements , Lloyd Mawson Maureen McAllister, Laura Clark, Karen Hooton, Myung-Hee Lee, Anne Hughes, Gaby Stewart, Dorothy-Grace Elder, Adam Briggs.

ORGANISATIONS REPRESENTED: Arthritis Care, Fibromyalgia Friends, Marfans Association, College of Occupational Therapy, Leuchie House Respite Centre, NHS GG&C, Intlife, Ministerial Group for Chronic Pain, British Acupuncture Council, Scottish Government, British Homeopathic Association, Complementary & Natural Healthcare Council, Edinburgh University,

### APOLOGIES

Frank Mawson, Prof. Martijn Steultjens, Dr Anne Hendry, Mariette Lobo, Jean Rafferty, Lord Foulkes, Cllr Jackie Burns, Susan and Barry Graham.